

---

SINGAPORE – At-Large - NARALO Monthly Meeting  
Thursday, February 12, 2015 – 10:00 to 11:00  
ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                    Develop for your patience and diligence, and being on the call, we will be starting at 5 after the hour sharp.

Okay, we're at six minutes after the hour. 10:00 AM in Singapore, I believe 9:00 PM in Eastern Time and that makes it 6:00 PM Pacific, so thank you to all who are joining the meeting.

My name is Evan Leibovitch. I am acting chair in the absence of Garth Bruen who could not make it. Myself, Judith Hellerstein is acting secretary and so we will be running this meeting together with four people from At-Large staff. I'm very impressed and gratified, so thank you all.

In taking a role, so here present at the meeting is Glenn McKnight, Alan Greenberg, Eduardo Diaz, Louis Houle, and Ron Sherwood who is actually the ccNSO is actually here, and he's going to be on the agenda briefly. From staff is Heidi, Gisella, Silvia, and Ariel.

Is anybody who is either on Adobe Connect or in the Adigo Bridge, could you please identify yourselves? Is anyone in Adigo?

GORDON CHILLCOTT:                Evan, it's Gordon Chillcott. I'm here.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                Hi Gordon.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

GORDON CHILLCOTT: I'm North America At-Large.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. You may need to speak up. You're coming in very low on the speakers here. We can hear you, but just barely.

GORDON CHILLCOTT: [Inaudible], Evan.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, thanks. Is there anybody else on Adigo besides Gordon? Is there anybody else on Adobe Connect? I don't have a screen in front of me?

ARIEL LIANG: [inaudible].

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. Ariel, could you read that into the record? Thanks.

ARIEL LIANG: We have several other remote participants on the Adobe Connect. They are Anthony Nigani, [inaudible] Gordon Chillcott and representative from Remote Hub ACUI Columbia, and one more person Joly McFee.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay, thanks to everybody who's participating, especially our friends back in North America where it starts, so thank you for coming in here.

Okay. Also, we're joined by Chris Mondini from ICANN who's not here to make a presentation, but may have something to say as we go along.

The agenda is actually fairly flexible. There's a couple of things that have come up through this week, so I'm going to verbally talk about the agenda that I'd like and then we can add other items afterwards as they come up or if anyone has other business.

The ones that I have, the ones that we want to talk about at this point is basically an update on the General Assembly proposal. Is Garth online? Okay. I want to briefly call attention to Garth's policy initiative. We need to talk about NARALO elections coming up and we're going to have a brief presentation from Ron on a new ALS coming in.

Does anybody here or on the call or online have anything else they would like to add to that agenda?

Okay, hearing nothing, we'll move on.

Okay. The first issue, just an update on the General Assembly. As you know, NARALO put in an application to the Budget & Finance Subcommittee to propose to have a General Assembly to take place alongside the ARIN Meeting Montreal in early October.

It's my understanding that the reception to that has been very positive both that it was worded well in such a way that made it easy to accept. Also, there are certain people, notably Ray Plzak from the ICANN board who've noted they've constantly wanted to have more communications



---

and relationships between At-Large structures and regions, and the local RIRs around the world.

For this reason, it seems like there's going to be a good reception for the GA proposal. That doesn't guarantee it's going to be accepted, but I think it has a strong possibility here.

Alan, go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Just noting that Ray's origins, how he got into this business was previously running ARIN, so he has a slight personal interest.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay, and the fact that it coincides that this is the year that NARALO has a formal relationship with ARIN for the first time, the MOU was signed on Sunday. That went very well. We will hopefully be making a PDF version of that that can be circulated by e-mail to the NARALO list.

Actually, the original of that is being passed around at the table here. I think it's a bit of an achievement. As a matter of fact, there was at least one other RALO that has approached me because they've been having some difficulties doing their own MOU. We may in fact be providing some guidance to another RALO.

One thing to note about this MOU is it is not very heavy on details, it's not very heavy on obligations, we have a mutual trust relationship to establish and the relationship between us and ARIN is basically as good as we make it. There's not a lot of obligations in that MOU. That was



---

deliberate. Our goal is to have some good relationships to establish mutual trust and then take it from there.

Any questions at this point about either the general assembly or the MOU with ARIN?

Glenn, go ahead.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I think it's a miss. Evan, you don't mention that you will be attending ARIN as part of the CROPP outreach.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry. That is correct. I've been approved through the CROPP program, so it's an outreach event as well and the outreach of course being creating relationships with ARIN and its stakeholders that I'll be act the ARIN Meeting in San Francisco in April with the full knowledge and blessing. Hopefully, we'll be meeting people and starting to set that up.

What I really want to do though is, through the General Assembly, is to expose the ALSs within NARALO to in fact the very different model of stakeholder relations that exists within the ARIN Meeting. That's really what I'm hoping for and one of the things I hope to get out of if the GA concept is approved.

Glenn, you have more?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yeah, just one other thing is I mentioned this a couple of years ago. ARIN has a fellowship for each of their locations. They take one person



---

per region, so one from Canada, one from the United States and one from the Caribbean. Their geography is slightly different that ICANN's, but I strongly encourage that Susan Hamlin is here. She's very, very interested in any NARALO applications. There is some opportunities. They have meetings three times a year.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay, thanks. Any other comments on either the GA or on the ARIN relationship? Okay, Heidi informs me that the link to the GA information has been put into the Adobe Connect room for anybody that needs the link. Okay, thanks.

Moving on from there, although these aren't specific things for NARALO, I just wanted to note that at the Singapore meeting, our people would have a very, very active role in a number of At-Large initiatives. NARALO is heavily arguably predominantly represented within things like the Technology Taskforce. Our initiatives within the accessibility group are significant.

Would anybody in either of those groups like to talk even briefly about your activities in there? Glenn, go ahead.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I'll talk about the Technical Taskforce and I'll ask Judith to carry on with it because we're both sitting on that committee.

We had a great meeting this morning. We have an extensive slideshow that we're going to share with you. I think NARALO is very well represented in the Technical Taskforce. Olivier does attend, one of the



---

only EURALO ones and we hope to encourage more from EURALO to participate.

But, I think we've made some really good strides. We do a lot of calls, but if you're interested in our achievements, I think we summarize it well with our slideshow.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, thanks. Judith, did you have something to add?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, hi. Also, we're going to be in combination with the Technology Task Force and in the Accessibility Committee. We're going to be putting in a special quest to run a pilot program on captioning with the aim not only for the accessibility, but also to increase engagement with different regions where bandwidth is a problem.

We've gotten a lot of feedback from different regions that they really want to increase engagement, but have trouble because of bandwidth issues, and as well as English on working group meeting. That's what the request will cover. Thank you so much.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thanks, Judith. Does anybody want to talk about the Accessibility Working group and our activities there?

Okay, seeing nothing, we move on.

Okay. [Ariel], could you please put up on the Adobe Connect, the PDF that was sent out by Garth sometime back? He's not here to speak to it,



---

but I just want to call it to everybody's attention. This is policy initiative that Garth put forward regarding complaints especially with a proposal to essentially take some of the compliance functions and bring them outside of ICANN itself as an independent body.

That proposal I think needs a significant amount of discussion within NARALO before we can move forward to ALAC for consideration both as a matter of substance and as a matter of tactics, but we do need to consider it. It's extremely well thought-out and I think we need to give it appropriate comment.

I'm hesitant to talk about it here at this meeting without Garth here actually to champion it. Is there anybody that wants to say anything about it? Alan, do you want to talk about it from the ALAC perspective?

ALAN GREENBERG:

No, I don't think so. I think when it comes to the ALAC, the ALAC will deal with it as such. In the substantive NARALO discussion, I will have some thoughts on putting something forward, which would be effective.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay, and in my comments on the mailing list to Garth, I said there's two issues. First of all, the substance of it is one thing, but the tone in which it's presented I think needs a lot of work in order to be presentable as advice if our goal is to affect change rather than just make noise. Alan, go ahead.





---

ALAN GREENBERG: I certainly can't disagree with that. The other issue, there's a lot of what I would call – and it's not a derogatory comment, but ancient history in it. To the extent that should be presented – and I know Garth feel strongly that it should – it should be in appendix and things like that, and things down under different regimes with different staff really cannot be attributed to the people who are in place now. I think we need to be a little bit careful that we don't end up presenting something that gets ignored because there's arguments saying it's not relevant to today's situation.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Understood that it needs some work. Like I say, without Garth here to defend it or discuss it, I'm really hesitant to bring it up to substantial discussion here. We'll take that to the mailing list and see what needs to be done before that can be brought, as far as I'm concerned, to ALAC for its consideration. Any other comments on that from either anyone in the room or anyone online before we move on? Okay, thanks.

Ron Sherwood, would you like to talk to us a little bit about what might be our newest ALS application coming up?

RON SHERWOOD: Can you hear me? Can everybody hear me?

Yes, I am in a bit of a unique situation.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry, could you just introduce yourself to the people in the room?



RON SHERWOOD:

I'm sorry, yes. My name is Ron Sherwood. I am the ccNSO liaison to ALAC and have been a part of ICANN business for a long, long time. I am now in the unique situation. I operate .VI in the Virgin Islands. I have residence and address in North America in Bellevue, Washington state, but I'm actually based most of the time in Panama, in the Cherokee province of Panama or in the Northwestern [inaudible] Mountains. It's that area that I'd like to discuss if possible because there is a very keen interest in ALAC and a possibility of forming an ALS there.

There are two groups involved at that point. There is a group of expats, people that have retired like me to an area where it's very beautiful, where there are wonderful people, where it's very inexpensive and where we can actually afford to live in retirement.

Then there's another group of Internet-based people who have Internet-based employment that can in fact work from anywhere in the world and choose that place.

But both of those groups are primarily English-speaking. They are not always frequently not at all bilingual and both groups would like to form an ALS or even to two ALSs that are geographically located in Panama, but really want to be a part of North America and the English-speaking ALAC region. I would love to hear what possibilities are.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Ron and I have had this conversation before, and in terms of a matter of if there is a notable American presence that can be established, there's two things. One of which is coming in as individuals, which is absolutely



---

allowed through NARALO to American citizens, but if they are planning to create an ALS, that ALS would be an organization, and that organization would have to have a home somewhere. If that home is Panama, then they're logically within LACRALO.

The last thing I want to do is start to engage in battles here, so just as a matter of information. It sounds like there's a number of individuals there that have a choice, the equivalent of dual citizenship if you would and would choose, and want to make a choice of one of the other. I'm honored and flattered that they want to be part of NARALO, but at the same time, I also don't want to get into turf wars.

What I'm going to suggest at this point is if they want to create an ALS, the ALS must be based within our geography. If they create an ALS that is organizationally based in Panama, we're going to run into problems.

There's two options. As individuals, they're all welcome to join. If they're American citizens or if they have an American presence, then they qualify and we would welcome them because we have in our own charter the ability to have individual members. If their goal is to create an ALS, that ALS has to have its home in this geography for the ALS itself to be considered for NARALO, otherwise, we're going to run into problems. I don't know how this is going to work with the people you're talking about.

Judith, you have your hand up.



---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: You may want to tell them to look at the ALSs around and some of them may be open to having individuals join them depending on the bylaws of that particular ALS.

I know in my ALS, I was geared to people who had lived a work in the DC area sometime and still have connections in that area with colleagues. They are all welcome to join as if they have lived and worked in the DC area. Other ALSes may also have similar bylaws in their bylaws in welcoming others. That could be not a possibility.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Ron, did you have any comments or questions based on – oh, Alan, I saw a finger up, I didn't know if that make you wanted to talk. Ron, I don't know if you've got any follow-up questions or anything like that, but I think that advice might be well taken in a sense that if they want to create an ALS, that ALS itself is going to have to be housed in the North American region for this to be a NARALO ALS.

If they want to join as individuals, that's a different story and I think there's not going to be a problem. But if they want to join as an ALS and the ALS is based in Central America, that's LAC RALO.

RON SHERWOOD: I understand. You used the word citizen. They're all US citizens or Canadian citizens. In other words, they're North American citizens. Their location is one of choice and frequently is 50% in Latin America and 50% in America.



---

You say the ALS must be based. An ALS is not necessarily a registered entity anywhere, is it? All it is, is a group of people deciding where they're from or where they want to be from. What is wrong with a group of expats who are part of the time (or even most of the time) in another area, but part of an English-speaking group locating their ALS in North America and using it even when they're not there?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

I have Alan in the queue, but I just want to ask if there was anyone on staff who is more knowledgeable on this specific criteria can tell me if there's a need for geographic location for an ALS itself?

Alan, go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. I'm not staff, but I have a moderate amount of knowledge. This specific bylaw – and I'm not talking about an At-Large rule, but the bylaw says – “The criterion standards for the service occasion of At-Large structures shall be established in such a way that participation by individual end-users who are citizens or residents of countries within the geographic region will predominate in any ALS and [so forth].”

The way I read that is if we have an ALS of US or Canadian citizens predominating, then it could well be a North American ALS. On the other hand, I think if we were to want to think of doing such a thing, we need to start discussions early with Latin America and make it. We don't want turf wars.



---

Technically, it may well be legal whether we can finesse so that we don't have ill will is not at all clear and I think we need to look at this barrier carefully.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Judith, go ahead.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: One idea might be since, thinking out of the box, is that possibly if they say they spend half the time in the US is maybe having one person set up a mailing address in the US. Then that way, we could say it's a US-based one and not have that turf war and trying to think out of the box there.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. I have Alan and Ron back in the queue, but Judith, I would think right now because they're citizens, regardless of how much percent they spend in one place or another, by virtue of being citizens of the US and Canada, I think we've already made that requirement.

I have Alan first and then Ron.

ALAN GREENBERG: I tried to make it clear. I believe the rules allow it. Now, it's how can we do it without establishing enemies, turf wars or ill-will and that's not a technicality of a mailing address. That's let's start talking about it and doing it in a controlled way with some finesse.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                   Okay, I have Ron and then Eduardo.

RON SHERWOOD:                   I concurred with what Alan just said. I wouldn't want to cause any trouble at all, and I think if it can be organized with goodwill alongside the Latin American region, that will be absolutely perfect.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                   Eduardo, go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ:                    I was going to say then put an action item and see if we can talk to the LACRALO officers. My impression is that they won't have a problem with having a [inaudible].

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                   Before Heidi, I would simply going to say takeaways in the action item that I would myself get involved and contact my counterpart in LACRALO and see if the two of us between us can just come to an understanding, so that there's no surprises. That this is done with full awareness and consent before the ALS application happens so nobody is saying, "Where did this come from?"

As an action item, I am fully prepared to take away that I will contact my counterpart in LACRALO and we'll try and to deal with it in that way. I have Heidi, and then Alan, and then Eduardo.

Heidi, go ahead.

---

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. I would like to have staff first have a thorough review of the NARALO MOU Operating Principles and the bylaws to take a look at this, as well as perhaps just have a word with legal just to make sure that everything is – what the parameters are for this.

Perhaps, before we move ahead with speaking to LACRALO just so we know what the rules are and the possibilities. Thank you.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, I mean, I don't think that's a problem. I think what Alan has read seems very clear, but if it's a full clarification, then we can get that.

Alan, you're next and then Eduardo.

ALAN GREENBERG: I would suggest two action items. The first charging ALAC staff and the ALAC chair, if you don't mind, to look into the formal issues.

The second action item, I would charge the NARALO chair with initiating discussions. I would not be quite as specific in saying with your counterpart. That's it.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. So I guess I'll have to track down the ALAC chair and see if he's amenable to that.

ALAN GREENBERG: If you can find him, he might be amenable.





---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                   Okay, Eduardo, go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ:                    I just wanted to mention that really when I look at in ALS and it's [resident] in a country other than being an American citizen, I think they're [great] in the ALSes at creating where there are residents to bring issues from that part of the globe into a [world] mixture.

Having an ALS from North America that does not live in North America, the issues in Panama might be different. But again, I'm not against it. It just comes to my mind that that's probably why we have these ALSes. Thank you.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                From what I'm hearing, it sounds like the issue that was not Panamanian problems, but from these ex-Americans and Canadians. For instance, there's an organization in Canada called the Canadian Snowbirds Association and its entire membership is people that spend half a year going South in the winter. It's based in Canada, but its members spend most of their time outside Canada.

I'm just saying there's precedent for this thing and there's lots of reason to go south in the winter from parts of Canada.

Alan?

---

ALAN GREENBERG: Just for clarity, they don't spend most of their time outside of Canada typically because the access to Canadian healthcare implies [inaudible] certain residence requirement. Typically, just a little less than half.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Yes, 49.9% of the time. Okay, Ron, you have the last word then we'll move on.

RON SHERWOOD: Thank you. There are two groups involved. In fact, one of them are retirees and the other is younger people who are employed in the Internet employment, which they can do from anywhere in the world no matter where they are or where they travel to.

The retirees are very interested group and have approached me. They are there. They're part of 2,500 retirees in a small area in the mountains 300 miles from Panama City. The other group is much smaller. It's only maybe 15 people, but they are Internet-related because of their employment and very much want to be a part of ICANN. Thank you.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: I think the final word is that if they want to get involved in ICANN and At-Large, I want to do whatever we can to make it to facilitate their trip in and as long as it's within the rules that we're capable of doing and as long as we're making peace.

Alan, you have the final-final word on this.



---

ALAN GREENBERG: Just in line with the discussions that we're having in At-Large and ALAC, on ensuring that ALSes actually have a nexus point of ICANN as opposed to with the Internet, it's going to be an interesting discussion of why these people want to be affiliated with ICANN as opposed to simply wanting some [tie]. Interesting going forward.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I will take that offline very happily.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Is there anybody who is online with us who has any comments or questions right now before we move on? I can't see the hands. My eyes aren't good enough to see if – Anthony, I see you've made a request about an update on the Mentorship Program. We'll have that under any other business. That's not really related to this. We'll take it up, but not right at this moment.

Oh, Anthony, you see your connection. Would you like to make a comment? Go ahead. Anthony, are you okay? Do you have audio, Anthony?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: He's not on voice.

ARIEL LIANG: He's not on Adigo. Tell him he needs to join Adigo.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                    Okay. Can somebody from staff read out what he’s typed in, please?

ARIEL LIANG:                         Anthony’s comment is, “Evan, can we have a quick discussion about the Indigenous Mentorship Program NARALO’s next steps?”

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:                    Okay. Anthony said that he’ll be calling in, so I’ll put this towards any other business at the end of the call. By that time, Anthony will have joined us and we can deal with a proper discussion of that.

Okay. Moving on from that, the last thing I have on my plate here is to talk about NARALO elections. We need to start thinking about putting into place the mechanisms for doing an election. Based on my understanding of where things are at right now, Eduardo Diaz is our ALAC representative. He is term limited so he cannot run for ALAC again. We have an open spot for the ALAC position for North America for a two-year term.

We have for chair and secretariat. These are both one-year terms, so they always come up for renewal. The NARALO appointment to the Nominating Committee also has to happen. That’s for one-year term.

Louis, are you eligible to run again?

LOUIS HOULE:                         No. For the NomCom, no.

---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. So we need to have a fresh person into the NonCom. We need a fresh person into the ALAC and we have elections for chair and secretariat.

Glenn, go ahead.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Maybe Louis can address this. Louis, what's the one of the recommendations that NomCom would be a two-year term, has that been implemented?

LOUIS HOULE: Yes, the recommendation would be a two-year term, but the decision hasn't been made yet, so it's not confirmed. But you know that one way or another, if you want to be productive, you absolutely need one year to know about the job, so it would be illogical for us to consider somebody would be available for at least two years.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, I have Alan in the queue, go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. On the recommendations, the comment period was reopened or extended and I think it just ended the end of January. We're not going to see any changes immediately, and the original report was quite silent on transition rules to say, "How do you treat people who have already had two years and if the new rules allow three, how do you handle that?" It's not at all clear.



---

It's certainly not going to happen in the next couple of months. It could concavely happen before the next NomCom needs to be selected. Could, but not highly likely. So that's one point.

If you attended the High Interest Topic Session on Monday, part of it was how do we get good volunteers, how do we get people to be actually contributors? We have a situation, which is true for a number of people in this room. We just identified two of them. Dedicated volunteers who have put a fair amount of work in, have at least on occasion delivered results and then they're term limited and we say, "Sayonara."

To some extent, we rotate positions and are accused of only opening them to insiders, and as long as the original people want to still go keep on rotating and we don't want to insult our friends. Our elections very much have to do with who do we not to insult and that perhaps is not the best way to choose our leaders and our representatives, but nevertheless, there's a real problem with how do you keep people engaged in a group like At-Large where they don't have a company paying travel.

Staying engaged just by participating in conference calls periodically, people tend to drift off, so I think we have a real problem, I think we need to raise it with ALAC and I think ALAC needs to raise it farther.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay. Well, since all three of our ALAC representatives are in the room, I think – I don't know if this is in a situation of an action item for our ALAC representatives to actually take to ALAC to raise this. I'm assuming since



---

you're all here, do we need to put this in a form of action item or can just the three of you take it under advisement?

Eduardo, go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm sure I got lost in some of what we need to bring to the ALAC. Can you repeat that? Thank you.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Alan, please clarify.

ALAN GREENBERG: The issue is people who – we complain that's hard getting people to commit themselves to work. We toss away very often the people who are term limited because we cannot keep them involved. I think that is a problem. I'm not proposing the solution, but I think it's a problem.

Yes, I think a formal statement of NARALO is something that we should pass forward and then the ALAC take formal action on it. I wear multiple hats here, but I think it's an issue that needs to be raised within ICANN and this is a good place to start as any.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Before I give the mic to Eduardo, Alan, is there a way that you could take your comments essentially, [inaudible] into a piece of e-mail into the NARALO mailing list and let us use that to start as a discussion point?



---

ALAN GREENBERG: I will add it to my to-do list and I would suggest an action item.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so we have an action item that Alan will draft a small summary of these comments here. We will put that into the mailing list and use that to start a region-wide discussion on the topic possibly to end in a future NARALO Meeting with consensus on something that we will then send to ALAC.

Eduardo, go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I assume I made myself clear. Are we talking about here about eliminating terms just that people – two-year terms so people can come?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: It's my understanding here that the first part of this is identifying the problem before we spend a lot of time on figuring out what the specific solution is going to be. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG: We can fix the problem with you by saying, "We don't have term limits." That's a NARALO rule.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Alan, there's people online, they have no idea who "you" is.





---

ALAN GREENBERG:

Sorry. I was pointing at Eduardo. We can fix problems that we have control over, but that doesn't address the issue of making Eduardo ALAC member for life, does not address the issue of how do we get more people in. It just changes the name on the tag of who can't be involved.

It's a real generic problem for those of us who don't have independent funding and I think we need to start the discussion. I don't know what the outcome is and there may not be an outcome, but I think we need to start the discussion.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Actually, with a little indulgence, this is a problem that is bigger than NARALO and arguably bigger than ALAC. Since we have Chris Mondini in the room, do you have anything you'd like to say about keeping volunteers engaged and how do you deal with things like term limits that are meant to bring fresh blood in, but at the same time have that opportunity to shout out people that have experience and a desire to act?

I don't mean to put you on the spot here, but this sounds like an issue that is beyond NARALO and even ALAC.

CHRISTOPHER MONDINI:

Thank you. I'm happy to comment extemporaneously as a member of the Global Stakeholder Engagement team. I and my colleagues have spent the greater part of the last 18 months to two years doing general awareness raising about ICANN, what it does and its importance to



---

various broadly defined stakeholder categories like business, academia, civil society and so forth.

We do have some indications that we've been successful in bringing new eyes, new people really to the doorstep and I think there are many people peering in. But yet, where the stakeholder, the pathway to effective participation via belonging in a structure within the SO/AC constellation is where really betrayal goes cold.

Sally Costerton who leads Global Stakeholder Engagement has recently joined with David Olive who as you know leads Policy Development to really work on bridging the gap between being aware and knowledgeable about the importance of ICANN to your own particular interest or stake in the Internet to effective fulfilling participation, making an impact, and really increasing the impact-to-cost ratio, overcoming hurdles to participation and really examining the reasons why new people become attracted to the process.

Now, as part of that, we've done some – in addition to trying to gather more data and both anecdotal, a qualitative and quantitative on where ICANN leaders have come from, how they are considered mid-career ICANN people, what happens for example the day after a fellowship program for somebody ends.

That's the beginning part of that of looking at ICANN itself, but also in terms of good practice of how communities are defined, maintained and sustained, and we find that within communities, there needs to be – that are healthy – and actually I think we'll be looking as something like the CROPP program. That's a little bit ahead of its time and I think



---

that's an area where we close the gap, we brought some resource that's very targeted to those particular outcomes.

I think there might be other ways to do something similar to create a pipeline of talent, so that you can almost see generationally how people start out from day one and ends up in leadership positions like you, and see that in five years or ten years or 20 years, they will be still a healthy sustainable leadership with these structures [in their] growing in vibrant community.

This is just a little bit of – I'm heartened that in almost every public session that I've dropped into from the GNSO council to the High Interest Topic Session to even the Board Technical Experts Group session that the issue not just of Outreach, but also cultivation and support for participation has been raised.

I think it's very much on the minds across the ICANN structures, so you can really take a leadership role and getting out in front, and identifying what some of those barriers are to having a healthy pipeline and generations of participants.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Okay, in the queue, I have Alan and then I have Louis.

Alan, go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Just a very quick comment just for the record. This will not have been the first time this issue came up with this meeting. It's about the third time that I've been involved in the discussion about it, so it's timely.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Even before that, Chris, I think I've seen an e-mail that you sent to the SO/AC leaders and you used the term "In-reach", which is actually something that has been in our lingo for a while, which can be as much of a challenge if not more than outreach. It's one thing to bring people in, it's another thing to keep them engaged once they're here.

Louis, go ahead.

LOUIS HOULE: Yes. I would like to add to that that the actual mechanism if I take a look at it from outside ICANN, it's very expensive to achieve what we have to achieve right now. Having new people, it's always to having to go to the same things, training and year after year, and there's a cost related to that. I think that there's somewhere a better balance that we have to try to reach.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. Thanks. Before we move on, is there any further discussion from anyone who is online either in Adobe Connect or in Adigo? Okay. That was not the sound of a contributor. That was the sound of a copy machine.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [Inaudible] sound.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay. One action item of this is I'm asking staff to start to put the mechanisms in place for holding election. We do not have quite the same time constraints as some of the other regions because the NomCom will not be picking a person for At-Large, for North American region for this year.

We don't have to have a situation where we hold our elections before the NomCom makes its choice. It's nice to have, but we're not necessarily constrained by the same dates because the NomCom doesn't have to care who we pick for ALAC because they're not choosing somebody for ALAC this year for North America.

Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG: You're completely correct, but to the extent that we can do it and make it easy on staff to not have efforts that are not synchronized, the better.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: I thought it would be easier not to have everything happening at the same time.

ALAN GREENBERG: If staff would like to suggest that as an easier path, I'm happy with it, too.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Heidi, go ahead.

---

HEIDI ULLRICH: I think if we could work the schedule, all of the RALOs and the ALACs that we know what we have coming on the pipeline, then we will come back to you with the determination of that.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so having said that, an action item then is putting in place, putting out the notices. I think I've identified correctly the positions that are open and the ones that must be refilled because of term limits and the discussions about in-reach and the effect of term limits on that, we obviously need to take forward.

So the last thing right now – that's all that I had on my original agenda. Under any other business, we have the comment from Tony from before about the Mentorship Program. Is there anybody else that has any other business to add? I have Louis and then Eduardo.

LOUIS HOULE: Just wanted to mention that I sent you guys talking about the NomCom, the December/January report card. Thank you.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thank you. Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, I was thinking [inaudible] reaching out with Glenn for a while, a couple minutes about the suggestion of putting together a NARALO



---

newsletter. I have seen this happening in Europe, every month it comes out and what they do is – I think it's ISOC [inaudible].

What they do is they get information from their different organizations, so what they're doing and they just put them together and they just send it around to everyone.

The reason I'm suggesting something like this is to think about communication with our ALSes, letting them know what we're doing and ask them for information so we can distribute this information across the region. I don't think it's a big thing to do, if people provide information.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: That sounds excellent, but you do realize what the immediate follow-up to that is.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I will take care of it.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so there we have the follow-up.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, sure. Yeah.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so as an action item coming out of here, that Eduardo will coordinate a group from other people from NARALO with the intention

---

of possibly putting together a newsletter that would go out and talk about our activities.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [Inaudible].

EDUARDO DIAZ: I don't know if we get translation, then yes.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Heidi, go ahead.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. This is an interesting initiative. Thank you, Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes.

HEIDI ULLRICH: It's interesting initiative.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Oh, thank you.

HEIDI ULLRICH: I'm just wondering the timeline. Would this be something that would be ready in time for the next ICANN public meeting in Buenos Aires or is this a monthly newsletter?



---

EDUARDO DIAZ: This is something easy for me to set up and I will say yes before the Buenos Aires. I will say this is something that we can do on a monthly basis, and I'm not thinking about generating [inaudible] as the ALS was saying new information and putting it together somehow. When you do that, it's easier than if you have to sit and generate something around.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry, Heidi, go ahead.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you, Evan. As a follow-up on [inaudible] distribution, it would be foreseen that this would be a print version or like a PDF?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: PDF electronic totally.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: We've just introduced the idea now, so can I ask Eduardo to bring together any community you'd like to and then work with staff in figuring out the distribution details.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: For our fiscal year – I mean, if you want to create [inaudible] fiscal year.



---

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so if there's an expense issue, there's a fiscal year thing, but your group can take it offline. If possible, a PDF version might be enough.

Judith, make it quickly, you want to go to the last [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. Question for the newsletter because I like the idea is, will you be doing the translation into Spanish and Louis doing in French or we're going to have to have the added cost of getting it translated professionally?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Sorry, I hate to intervene, but I want to move on to the next thing. That's an implementation detail. We've just come up with the idea right now. Let's take it offline, build the community, find out the distribution formats and deal with translation issues as we've done it. We've literally just introduced the idea now.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I had a question about something else.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, all right, but right now for the something else, I'm going to turn the mic over to Anthony who is online. We want to deal with the issue. We have about five minutes left in the hour and I don't want to ignore his issue talking about the Mentorship Program. Anthony, are you with us by audio?



---

ANTHONY NIIGANII: Yes, I'm here.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, the mic is yours.

ANTHONY NIIGANII: Can you hear me?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Absolutely, go ahead.

ANTHONY NIIGANII: I just want to give a quick update from Heidi of where it's at, but I do know that [inaudible] had submitted her application. My application for the internship program will be coming in within the next week.

But just to find out how far can this program reach? Is it specifically for the NARALO region or do we want to – as a priority and end focus on a global community or do we want two and capture both within the same program? I'm not sure how much the budget has been set aside for it in total, but is it something that is being considered at this point in time?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, thanks. Heidi, go ahead.



---

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you, Anthony. Currently, the proposal we have on the table is only from Native Public Media regarding North American indigenous persons.

During the meeting of the Finance & Budget Subcommittee we had earlier this week to review that, it was suggested that that should be a global mentoring program.

We are going to be working with other groups. For example, in New Zealand, in Australia. If you could send your document, rather than having separate request, we might incorporate yours into that.

In terms of budget set aside, there is no determination of that yet, so the process would work where we would submit that if it passes the [FBSC] and then it would go into the internal process and that will then determine whether that program is accepted. I hope that answered your question.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Anthony, do you have any follow-ups?

ANTHONY NIIGANII: No, thank you, Heidi. That answered my question.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: We've covered that off. Judith, did you have something else to add to any of the business?



---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. My question is relating to the CROPP and I know your trip and Evan's, and mine are coming up quickly and I'm wondering, we had the showcase in the new business cards, which I don't think we made any change. I know we made changes to the page. Are we going to be using those at the event in March? Are we going to be using the old information? Is it going to be shipped to the hotel in Austin that you guys are saying and a section also given to me that I can pick up to that hotel? Those are those quick questions that I had on that.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Heidi, would you like to answer?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Please send staff and know exactly what you're looking for. We can probably send the NARALO pop-up. I don't know how many of those business cards we have left. The Outreach document that we previewed yesterday in the joint session of the Outreach and Regional Secretariat Meeting may be ready by then, but it would not be the NARALO. It only be the overall ALAC At-Large one that we looked at yesterday. I do believe that we have a lot of NARALO [tri-folds] left that we could ship in English, French and Spanish.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Okay, so here we are. We are at the top of the hour exactly on time and we have covered all of the any other business, unless there is any last-minute things that will take us overtime. Does anyone have any last comments or questions either from within the room or online?



---

Going once, going twice. Okay, thank you very much. We are adjourned.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

